

The following is a copy of **Clause G1, Administrative Report No. 11-2010** which was **ADOPTED** by City Council at its meeting held on **June 28, 2010**:

## **Section G – CITY MANAGER**

### **G1) River Landing Destination Centre Award of Professional Consultant Services (File No. CK. 4129-15 and CC. 4130-2)**

- RECOMMENDATION:**
- 1) that the consultant team of Kuwabara Payne McKenna Blumberg Architects in association with Smith Carter Architects and Engineers Incorporated, be approved, for the design of the Art Gallery of Saskatchewan, an underground parking garage, and an expansion of the existing Persephone Theatre, for the upset limit for professional fees of \$5,486,241 (including G.S.T. and P.S.T.) be approved, subject to receiving a formal letter of approval in principle from Infrastructure Canada; and,
  - 2) that the City Solicitor be instructed to prepare the necessary agreement for execution by His Worship the Mayor and the City Clerk under the corporate seal.

## **REPORT**

Capital Project #1788 – River Landing Destination Centre includes the Art Gallery of Saskatchewan, a public gathering space and winter haven for River Landing visitors; areas complementary to an art gallery; an underground parking garage; and an expansion of the existing Persephone Theatre. A two-stage, quality-based, selection process was developed which included an Expression of Interest/Request for Proposal terms of reference.

### **Analysis of the Proposals**

The proposals were rated systematically according to five groups of criteria under the following headings: Design Team; Understanding of the Project; Proposed Approach; Experience; and Fee Proposal. Fifteen Expressions of Interest were received. Following analysis by the Architectural Design Selection Committee, five teams were invited to submit detailed proposals. One team withdrew for internal reasons.

The Request for Proposal (RFP) required the short-listed firms to provide written proposals and be subject to an interview by the Architectural Design Selection Committee. The Architectural Design Selection Committee (Attachment 1) interviewed the short-listed companies on May 20 and 21, 2010, and reviewed the written proposals on June 10, 2010.

The proposals were evaluated according to the following points rating for each criteria:

Proposed design team	25%
Proposed approach to the project	25%
Understanding of the project	20%
Application of related experience	20%
Fee proposal	10%
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>100%</b>

Four teams submitted detailed proposals including the professional consulting fees. All fees proposed by the teams were within budget. The four teams included:

- Gibbs Gage Architects (Calgary)/Frederick Fisher and Partners Architects (Los Angeles)
- Kuwabara Payne McKenna Blumberg (KPMB) Architects (Toronto) in Association with Smith Carter Architects and Engineers Incorporated (Winnipeg)
- Number TEN Architectural Group (Winnipeg)/Klypak Rusick Architects (Saskatoon)/Diamond and Schmitt Architects Inc. (Toronto)
- Teeple Architects Inc. (Toronto)/P3 Architecture Ltd. (Regina and Saskatoon)

The Architectural Design Selection Committee systematically evaluated the proposals according to the rating criteria and unanimously selected the team of Kuwabara Payne McKenna Blumberg (KPMB) Architects in association with Smith Carter Architects and Engineers Incorporated. KPMB is a well respected Toronto firm with a diverse body of work. Among the art gallery projects it has designed are the Gardiner Museum of Ceramic Art and the Art Gallery of Hamilton. Smith Carter is a well established Winnipeg firm and is currently working as part of the team on the Canadian Museum of Human Rights. The two firms have successfully collaborated on previous projects including the new Canadian Embassy in Berlin and the Manitoba Hydro Place in Winnipeg. The key personnel assigned to the project all have gallery and museum experience. The team has strong engineering and specialist consultants.

KPMB is the design architect with Smith Carter undertaking the technical drawings. They intend to use local engineering firms for the construction period, selected in consultation with City Administration. The collaboration of the team will be further facilitated by developing the building using a shared BIM three-dimensional model. The proposal was well articulated and provided a thoughtful statement on their understanding of the project. The proposal described a collaborative approach based on appropriate consultation with input from all stakeholders and the community.

The Board of Trustees of the Mendel Art Gallery, at its meeting of June 10, 2010, unanimously endorsed the recommendation “That the Board of Trustees of the Mendel Art Gallery endorses the recommendations of the Architectural Design Selection Committee that Kuwabara Payne McKenna Blumberg Architects in association with Smith Carter Architects and Engineers Incorporated be engaged as the architect for the Art Gallery of Saskatchewan and Related Facilities and unreservedly supports this recommendation being made to City Council.”

Persephone Theatre’s Site Committee, at its meeting of June 14, 2010, endorsed the recommendation of the Architectural Design Selection Committee that Kuwabara Payne McKenna Blumberg Architects in association with Smith Carter Architects and Engineers Incorporated be engaged as the architect for the Art Gallery of Saskatchewan and Related Facilities. The Persephone Theatre Board of Directors at its meeting of June 21, 2010, approves the Art Gallery of Saskatchewan Selection Committee’s recommendation to appoint KPMB/Smith Carter as architect for the Art Gallery of Saskatchewan and Persephone Theatre’s expansion project.

Your Administration has identified an estimate for the design costs including specialists and disbursements for the Art Gallery of Saskatchewan and the underground parking and it is within the budget estimated.

The net cost to the City for consultant services by KPMB/Smith Carter is as follows:

Base Fee	\$3,985,000
Additional Fee for Parking Structure	\$ 290,000
Sub-Consultants	\$ 515,000
Expenses	<u>\$ 373,920</u>
Sub-total	\$5,163,920
P.S.T.	<u>\$ 64,125</u>
Total Fee to the City	\$5,228,045
G.S.T.	<u>\$ 258,196</u>
<b>TOTAL FEE</b>	<b><u>\$5,486,241</u></b>
Less G.S.T. Rebate	\$(258,196)
Net Cost to City	<u>\$5,228,045</u>

### **FINANCIAL IMPACT**

The project has received conditional funding approval from the Government of Canada (\$13.02 million), and Government of Saskatchewan (\$13.02 million), under the Building Canada Fund Major Infrastructure Component. The functional program plan was submitted to Infrastructure Canada immediately following City Council approval of the document on April 26, 2010.

An Infrastructure Canada representative has been corresponding on a regular basis with the Administration regarding questions of follow-up as they analyze the project and Class “D” estimate of costs. All questions have been responded to diligently and in a timely manner. On June 10, 2010, an email was received from the Policy Section of Infrastructure Canada indicating they had completed their project review of the Art Gallery of Saskatchewan, and the review documentation was now going to the Project Approval Board. The Project Approval Board will complete its project review and if there are no further questions or changes, the project review will then proceed for signature to the Assistant Deputy Minister and the Deputy Minister, and then to the Minister of Transport, Infrastructure and Communities. Should the Minister provide approval in principle, the next step of the process will commence, which is the development of the Contribution Agreement. Your Administration is recommending that the professional consulting services contract be awarded, subject to receiving a letter of approval from Infrastructure Canada.

**PUBLIC NOTICE**

Public Notice pursuant to Section 3 of Policy No. C01-021, Public Notice Policy, is not required.

**ATTACHMENT**

1. Architectural Design Selection Committee